Jeffrey D. Hill v. New Castle County, et al.
C. A. No. 07-228 (GMS)
Plaintiff's Answering Brief In Opposition Of Defendants' Motion For Summary Judgment

APPENDIX A PART 1

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE

JEFFREY D. HILL,

Plaintiff,

V.

)Civil Action No.)07-228 (GMS)

NEW CASTLE COUNTY, a municipal corporation, SGT. ANDREA HYDEN, in her individual capacity, CAPT. MARK HITCH, in his individual capacity, and CAPT. QUINTON WATSON, in his individual capacity,

Defendants.

Deposition of JEFFREY D. HILL, taken pursuant to notice at the offices of New Castle County Government Center, 87 Reads Way, New Castle, Delaware, beginning at 9:30 a.m. on Tuesday, December 18, 2007, before Ann M. Calligan, Registered Merit Reporter and Notary Public.

APPEARANCES:

JEFFREY K. MARTIN, Esquire
MARTIN & WILSON, P.A.
1508 Pennsylvania Avenue
Wilmington, Delaware 19806
on behalf of the Plaintiff,

MEGAN SANFRANCESCO, Esquire
NEW CASTLE COUNTY LAW DEPARTMENT
87 Reads Way
New Castle, Delaware 19720
on behalf of the Defendants.

WILCOX & FETZER

1330 King Street - Wilmington, Delaware 19801

(302) 655-0477

www.wilfet.com





1	ALSO PRESENT:
2	SGT. NICOLE HYDEN
3	——————————————————————————————————————
4	JEFFREY D. HILL,
5	the witness herein, having first been
6	duly sworn on oath, was examined and
7	testified as follows:
8	EXAMINATION
9	BY MS. SANFRANCESCO:
LO	Q. My name is Megan Sanfrancesco. I'm an attorney
L1	for the New Castle County Law Department. I'm also
L2	the attorney for Sergeant Hyden, Captains Hitch and
L3	Watson. I'm going to be asking you some questions
L4	relating to the law suit that you filed against them.
L5	Have you ever had your deposition taken
<u>.</u> 6	before?
_7	A. Yes.
.8	Q. What type of circumstance?
9	A. Civil deposition, where somebody was injured.
20	Q. Were you the officer involved?
21	A. No. No.
22	Q. In what capacity were you deposed? Were you a
23	plaintiff or defendant?
24	A. A witness.

- Q. Have you ever had your deposition taken any other time?
 - A. Not that I recall.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

24

Q. Just a few ground rules for the deposition process you probably are already familiar with. We need to have you verbalize your response for the court reporter. She won't be able to take down a shake of the head, things like that, gestures. So if I ask you a question, try and verbalize your response.

If I ask you a question that you don't understand, just tell me and I'll try and rephrase it in a way that you can understand.

We will be able to take breaks. If you need to use the facilities or get a drink of water, just let us know and we can stop, accommodate that request.

- A. Okay.
- Q. Do you have any questions for me before we start?
- 20 A. No.
- Q. Before you got sworn in, your attorney just told me you had just come off midnight shift last night.
 - A. No. Couple days ago.

Not that I can recall.

24

Α.

1	Q. Did you in any other way prepare for the
2	deposition today, any other review, any other things,
3	documents?
4	A. Yes.
5	Q. What was that?
6	A. I reviewed the case with the lawyer.
7	Q. You said that you had reviewed the complaint
8	that was filed in this matter. Did you also have a
9	chance to review the amended complaint?
10	A. No.
11	Q. I hand you a copy of the proposed amended
12,	complaint in this matter. It actually states
13	"Complaint" as the caption which is just a typo. It's
14	an amended complaint that adds all of the information
15	that's been underlined. If you could take a minute to
16	look through this, I just want to confirm that you
17	have an understanding of what's contained in that
18	document?
19	MR. MARTIN: While we are off the record,
20	take whatever time you need, make sure you're familiar
21	with it.
22	(Discussion off the record.)
23	(Hill Deposition Exhibit 1 was marked for

24

identification.)

any conversations that you may have had with your

attorneys about that. I want you to answer the question based on your own personal knowledge.

- A. Can you repeat the question, please?
- Q. The question is, in the amended complaint
 Sergeant Andrea Hyden, Captain Mark Hitch and Captain
 Quinton Watson were added as individual defendants.
 What is your understanding of why they were added as
- A. Due to the fact they were directly involved in what transpired.
 - Q. And what transpired meaning what?

individual defendants?

- A. The actions taken against me that were listed in the complaint here.
- Q. Do you know what it means to sue a defendant in their individual capacity as opposed to their official capacity?
- MR. MARTIN: I'm going to direct him not to answer based upon anything he's discussed with counsel, but if he has knowledge before or after that, that's fine.
- Q. Again, clarify the question. I don't want you to answer anything that you have discussed with your counsel. I'm asking you based on your independent knowledge.

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

- conclusion of our meetings and what transpired approximately a month and a half later were retaliatory actions.
- You're saying Captain Hitch retaliated against

was abruptly called into his -- him and Captain

Watson's office and explained to me I was being

22

23

transferred.

- Q. Is it your opinion that Captain Hitch and Captain Watson requested your transfer out of the mounted unit?
- A. I would say they were in the chain that did so, ves.
- Q. What is your understanding of retaliation?

 MR. MARTIN: Again, caution him not to

 express anything he may have discussed with counsel.
- Q. We'll state a standing -- I don't know what you want to call it -- understanding on the record. Any question I ask you, I don't expect you to discuss with me any conversations that you had with your counsel.

 Of course, your counsel will remind you of that whenever I ask a question, but that's not my intent.

So, again, the question was, what do you consider retaliation? What's your understanding of what retaliation is?

- A. Actions taken against someone for something they may have said or done.
- Q. In this particular context, what is it that you may have said or done that you believe led Captain Hitch to retaliate against you?
 - A. The fact that I made a complaint against

Sergeant Hyden.

1

2

3

4

5

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

- Q. What about Captain Watson, is it your opinion that he retaliated against you?
 - A. Yes.
 - O. How did he do that?
- A. Both captains called me into the office.

 Obviously, they were -- they had just changed from one

 captain was running the unit to another captain

 running the unit. So being that they both -- in my

 opinion they both made that decision.
 - Q. Is it your opinion that Captain Watson retaliated against you for the same reasons you just explained Captain Hitch retaliated against you, or is it something different?
 - A. Repeat that, please.
 - Q. Do you believe that Captain Watson did something different from Captain Hitch in terms of retaliating against you, or is it the same claim that you have against Captain Watson and Captain Hitch?
 - A. Generally it's the -- it's the same incident, so it would be the same claim.
 - Q. Is there anything else, any other actions that Captain Watson took that you are suing him for?
 - A. Not to my knowledge.

- 1 Q. So just so we are clear, my understanding from
- 2 | what you said is that your claim against Captain
- 3 Watson is that he retaliated against you by
- 4 transferring you out of the mounted unit because you
- 5 | filed a complaint against Sergeant Hyden, is that
- 6 | correct?

- 7 | A. Yes.
 - Q. What are your claims against Sergeant Hyden?
- 9 A. Retaliation as well as gender discrimination.
- 10 Q. Can you explain how Sergeant Hyden retaliated
- 11 | against you?
- 12 A. Yes. I believe she was directly involved in
- 13 | lobbying for my transfer because I made a complaint
- 14 | against her.
- 15 Q. And can you explain how she discriminated
- 16 against you because of your gender?
- 17 A. Well, yes, I can. There were different
- 18 occasions where she -- gender discrimination. I'm not
- 19 | sure if you're looking for examples or what you're
- 20 looking for exactly in that. So you're going to --
- 21 Q. I think we are going to go through and discuss
- 22 some of the allegations that are made in the
- 23 | complaint.
- 24 A. Okay.



- Q. Are the allegations that are contained the examples that you are referring to?
- A. Is that what you're asking me to comment about, is the --
 - Q. No. Let me clarify the question.
- A. Okay.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

- Q. In your complaint there are examples of let's call them issue or incidents or things that occurred between you and Sergeant Hyden over the years. Are those the examples that you're talking about that led you to believe that Sergeant Hyden is discriminating against you because of your gender?
- 13 A. Yes.
 - Q. Are there any other examples besides what's contained in the complaint or the amended complaint?
 - A. There could be. There's a lot of things.
 - Q. And did you --
 - A. I may not recall everything from that many years ago. There are some things on paper, but there are other things that I may recall at a later time.
 - Q. Nothing that you recall now?
 - A. If you have anything to show me that there may be other things we are talking about, then, I may be able to recall them.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

.17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

Α.

- I'm asking you the question as to whether or not you recall any other incidents besides what's contained in the complaint right at this time? A. I'd have to take time to think about that. Q. How much time do you need to think about that? Α. I don't know. MS. SANFRANCESCO: I think we need to take a slight break so Corporal Hill can reflect as to whether or not there are any other incidents besides what's contained in the complaint that relate to his gender discrimination claim against Sergeant Hyden. MR. MARTIN: You've not laid a foundation suggesting that, you know, any other items may be recalled during this recess. I'm not saying I have MS. SANFRANCESCO: anything. I'm asking -- let's go off the record. (Discussion off the record.) BY MS. SANFRANCESCO: The question is, aside from what's contained in Q. the complaint, do you have any other incidence of gender discrimination by Sergeant Hyden that you are aware of at this time?
- but at this particular time, the answer is no.

At this particular time, no. I could later,

- Q. And have you had an opportunity to think about all of what had transpired with Sergeant Hyden prior to filing the complaint?
 - A. Yes.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

- Q. You have provided some documents to your attorney relative to the matters that are contained in the complaint. I just got some of those documents on Friday. And those documents are some performance evaluations, the EOC file, some time sheets. Prior to that time, your attorneys have provided a number of other documents, time sheets, tax forms, things of that nature. Is it fair to say that you provided your attorneys with documents relative to the matters contained in the complaint?
- A. Yes.
 - Q. Did you provide your attorneys with all the documents that you have relative to the matters contained in the complaint?
 - A. I believe so.
- Q. Did you ever have any documents that existed at one point but no longer exist?
 - A. No.
- Q. Did you ever take any personal notes relative to the matters contained in the complaint?

- A. I believe I did.
- 2 Q. Do you have those notes still?
- 3 A. I believe -- I possibly do yes.
- 4 Q. Did you provide those notes to your attorneys?
 - A. Those, if I have them, no.
- Q. Did your attorneys make a request for all documents that you have in connection with this
- 8 | matter?

5

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

- 9 A. I recall when I turned them over. I don't know
 10 if they were asked for or I volunteered them. I did
 11 turn over my paperwork.
- Q. Is there a reason why you did not turn over vour personal notes regarding these matters?
 - A. My personal notes, they may be in there. It was -- I'm not sure what's in there, everything in the file. I'd have to look at it again.
 - Q. I'll represent to you that I did not see any of your personal notes contained in either discovery. So what I'm going to ask from you is, we are going to continue this deposition on another date. Between this time and that time, I'd like you to review all of your records that you have at home, including your personal notes and provide those to your attorney so that we can review them and then discuss them at the

next deposition. Do you understand that request?

A. Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

- Q. What was the subject matter of your personal notes, if you remember?
 - A. Well, a lot of my notes were mental notes, so just reflecting on the issues at hand, issues of the problems I was having.
 - Q. When you say "mental notes," I'm not sure what you mean.
- A. These were things I heard, things I saw, things of that nature.
- Q. Were these notes that you took, you mean, while you were at work or at home or what types of --
- A. Well, obviously, when I take a mental note, it's after something that just happened or occurred.
- Q. Were these relative to the events with Sergeant Hyden or Captains Hitch or Watson?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. When did you start taking these notes?
- 20 A. I don't recall exactly when.
- Q. Like I said, try and get those for the next deposition, and we'll review them at that time.
- 23 A. Okay.
 - Q. Corporal Hill, I want to go over a few

- 1 background questions. Where do you live right now?
- 2 A. My exact address?
- 3 Q. Mm-hmm.
- 4 A. 670 Port Penn Road, Middletown, Delaware,
- 5 | 19709.
- 6 | Q. How long have you lived there?
- 7 A. A little over a year.
- 8 Q. Who do you live there with?
- 9 A. Myself.
- 10 Q. And where did you live before that?
- 11 A. 51 Mailly Drive, Townsend, Delaware, 19734.
- 12 | Q. How long did you live there?
- 13 A. Approximately six to seven years I think.
- 14 Q. And who did you live there with?
- 15 A. Myself.
- 16 Q. Either of these addresses, no roommates?
- 17 A. I had -- I've had a roommate that lived with me
- 18 years ago. It was a friend of mine. My one
- 19 girlfriend resided there back and forth between her
- 20 house and my house, but nobody claimed it as their
- 21 primary residence.
- 22 Q. Let me ask you this. What year would you say
- 23 | your issues or problems with Sergeant Hyden began?
- 24 A. Maybe 2000 -- I'd have to look over the notes.

When did she live there?

24

Q.

- A. She didn't live there.
- 2 Q. She stayed there with you from time to time?
- 3 A. Yes.

- 4 Q. During the time period that we discussed,
- 5 January of '04 through the present?
- 6 A. Not that whole time, no.
- 7 | Q. But in between that time?
- 8 A. There was a time frame in there, yes, where she
- 9 did stay at my house.
- 10 | O. Who else?
- 11 A. That was at 51 Mailly Drive.
- 12 Q. Okay.
- 13 A. This past spring, a fellow co-worker stayed at
- 14 | my new residence for a month or so because he was
- 15 | going through a separation with his wife.
- 16 Q. Who was that?
- 17 A. His name is Jason Mollohan.
- 18 Q. He works for the county police department?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. And you said this was at your new residence?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. At --
- 23 A. 670 Port Penn Road.
- 24 MR. MARTIN: Let's stop for a moment. Off

the record.

1

4

5

6

7

8

9

15

19

20

24

2 (Discussion off the record.)

3 BY MS. SANFRANCESCO:

- Q. Other than those two individuals, have you resided with anyone else from January of 2004 to the present?
- A. Not that I can recall.
- Q. Did you ever reside with any other members of the New Castle County Police Department?
- 10 A. During this time period?
- 11 Q. During any time period.
- 12 A. Yes. It was an Officer Scott Twigg stayed at
 13 my residence at 51 Mailly Drive for another short time
 14 period because he also was going through a separation.
 - O. Do you recall when that was?
- 16 A. I wasn't living at the house at 51 Mailly Drive 17 that long at the time, so late nineties, early 2000 18 maybe.
 - Q. How about any other members of the New Castle County Police Department?
- 21 A. Not that I can recall.
- Q. How long have you worked for the county, either in a police officer capacity or otherwise?
 - A. Between 15 and 16 years.

- 1 | Q. Was it always as a police officer, or no?
- 2 A. No.
- 3 Q. What did you do for the county before you were
- 4 | a police officer?
- 5 A. I worked for the county for a little under a
- 6 | year as a motor equipment operator.
- 7 Q. Who was your supervisor at that time?
- 8 A. I believe his last name was Cheyney. I forget
- 9 his first name.
- 10 Q. Do you know the time period that this was?
- 11 A. I believe -- actually, let me back up. I
- 12 | worked as motor equipment operator. I also worked as
- 13 | a seasonal summer employee the summer before I was
- 14 | hired by the county police.
- 15 Q. So that was the summer of --
- 16 A. That was the seasonal -- the seasonal time was
- 17 | the summer of -- that would have been the summer of
- 18 92.
- 19 Q. Was it the same supervisor at that time,
- 20 | Cheyney or somebody?
- 21 A. No. It was for a month, and I don't recall his
- 22 name.
- 23 | Q. Prior to becoming a New Castle County police
- 24 | officer which I presume was sometime after 1992 and

- aside from your seasonal experience at the county and aside from your motor equipment operator experience at the county, what did you do?
 - A. Prior to that I was a college student.
- Q. Where did you go to college?
- 6 A. Delaware Tech.
 - Q. What years did you go there?
 - A. '90 -- maybe part of the -- '90, '91, and '92.
 - Q. Did you graduate from Delaware Tech?
- 10 A. Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

7

8

- 11 Q. What was your degree in?
- 12 A. Criminal justice.
- 13 Q. Did you hold any other jobs or other
- 14 | employment, any military experience?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. Can you tell me about that?
- 17 | A. I was in the U.S. Army from 1986, 1987, and
- 18 | '88.
- 19 Q. What did you do in the U.S. Army?
- 20 | A. I worked in the aviation unit as a fuel
- 21 | specialist, I believe is what the terminology was.
- 22 | O. What did you do as a fuel specialist?
- 23 A. Tested aviation fuels and also assisted with
- 24 | tactical type situations that related to that and with

aircraft.

- 2 Q. What were your circumstances on leaving the
- 3 Army?

- 4 A. I joined for three years. When my time was up,
- 5 | I left.
- 6 | Q. How about after that, what did you do?
- 7 A. After that, was when I became a motor -- well,
- 8 | for a short time, like I said, I was a motor equipment
- 9 operator with the county and at that time going to
- 10 | school part time.
- 11 Q. Aside from what we've already discussed, have
- 12 | you held any other jobs prior to becoming a New Castle
- 13 | County police officer? And I don't mean like when you
- 14 | were in high school working for Dairy Queen or
- 15 | something. I mean any other jobs when you were like
- 16 21 or older.
- 17 A. I held some part-time jobs while I was in
- 18 | college, yes.
- 19 Q. Can you tell me about those?
- 20 | A. I worked at Foot Locker in the mall, Christiana
- 21 | Mall, for a time period. I worked at Doris Market in
- 22 | the deli section. When I got out of the military I
- 23 | worked at Down Under Restaurant and Bar in Newark.
- 24 | Q. How long did you work there for?

- A. I'm not sure. A few months.
- 2 Q. Okay. What did you do there?
- 3 A. Bar backed and bar tended.
- 4 Q. Have you ever been married?
- 5 A. No.

- 6 | Q. Do you have a significant other at this time?
- 7 A. No.
- 8 O. Have any children?
- 9 A. No.
- 10 Q. From January 2004 until, let's say, the present
- 11 | time, have you dated people?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. How often would you say that you dated?
- 14 A. Well, like I said, I was dating Katie Bowers
- 15 for a portion of that time.
- 16 Q. Would you call that a significant relationship
- 17 | as opposed to sort of dating someone casually?
- 18 A. I considered her my girlfriend.
- 19 Q. Did you have any other girlfriends from January
- 20 | 2004 to the present besides her?
- MR. MARTIN: I'm going to object. Let's
- 22 go off the record here.

24

23 (Discussion off the record.)

S-k-u-r-k-i-s I believe.

24

Α.

- How long did you date her? How long were you together?
 - Approximately three, four months. Α.
- Aside from Eileen and Ms. Bowers, have you 0. dated anyone else for, let's say, three months or more
- 7 Not that I recall. Α.

from 2004 to 2006?

1

2

3

5

6

13

14

15

16

19

- I'm sorry. You said you've been a New Castle 8 Q. County police officer for how long? 9
- I was hired in September of 1992. 10 Α.
- Where did you start out in the police 11 0. 12 department?
 - I was hired approximately three to four months Α. prior to the academy starting, so I was an employee working in the police station.
 - Then what was your assignment? Q.
- General work around the building, helping out 17 with evidence and supply, records unit. 18
 - Did you have a supervisor at that time? 0.
- I guess it would have been the drill Α. instructors that were going to have the academy coming 21 22 up in January.
- I'm talking about after you graduated from the 23 What was your first assignment? 24 academy.

- A. My first assignment was patrol.
- Q. Where were you assigned? Did you have a
- 3 | specific sector or --
- 4 A. My first assignment was in 2 zone, which is
- 5 | the -- I guess you call it the west side of New Castle
- 6 County.
- 7 Q. How long were you there for?
- 8 A. I don't recall exactly.
- 9 Q. Do you recall who your supervisor was?
- 10 A. I believe my first service supervisor was
- 11 | Sergeant Hernandez.
- 12 Q. What was your next assignment after that?
- 13 A. After patrol or after that particular area
- 14 | where I worked?
- 15 | O. After that particular area where you worked.
- 16 A. I worked on the west side for a while. I don't
- 17 | know exactly how long. I worked in different sectors
- 18 on patrol within the county, different time periods.
- 19 Q. How did you move from sector to sector?
- 20 A. Sometimes they reassign people.
- 21 Q. And what about other times?
- 22 A. I don't recall. I -- just different areas.
- 23 Sometimes you go from area to area. Sometimes they
- 24 need people in certain areas. Sometimes they don't.

- Sometimes there's a need for manpower in a certain area more than other areas and they move people around.
- Q. Why don't I make this easier. What I'm trying to do is find what you've done since the time you started in the police department until you got to the mounted unit.
- A. Okay.

- Q. So if you could tell me where you've been, how long you've been there, and who your supervisor was, I'd like to have that information.
- A. Every supervisor each step of the way to the mounted unit, is that what you're asking?
- 14 Q. If you can remember.
 - A. I worked in patrol from the time I got out of the academy until the time I got transferred into the mounted unit. During that time period, I worked in, to my knowledge, every sector or every district in New Castle County. I had different supervisors. Usually there's a different supervisor assigned to different districts. So I worked for Sergeant Hernandez. I believe -- I don't know if the order of supervisors is exactly correct, but I remember working for Sergeant Schofield, Sergeant Marbury. Well, at the time

- 1 | Sergeant Schreiber, how Lieutenant Schreiber.
- Q. How long did you work for Sergeant Schrieber
- 3 before he was a lieutenant?
- 4 A. I worked for him down in the Middletown
- 5 district on two different occasions on two different
- 6 | squads. The exact time -- probably a year, a year or
- 7 | more.
- 8 | Q. Okay?
- 9 A. Sergeant Riddell.
- Now, these are all prior to going into the
- 11 | mounted unit?
- 12 | O. Yes.
- 13 A. I believe I worked for Sergeant Avena for a
- 14 | while when I first -- when I come out of the academy
- 15 | for a little while. There could be other sergeants I
- 16 | worked for for short periods of time that I'm not
- 17 | recalling at this time.
- 18 | Q. What was your assignment immediately prior to
- 19 | going into the mounted unit?
- 20 A. Patrol.
- 21 | Q. How did you get into the mounted unit?
- 22 A. I requested it through a memorandum.
- Q. Do you recall who that memo was sent to?
- 24 A. I believe it was -- when you request a unit, it

- goes directly to the chief of police, I think, through the chain of command.
- Q. Prior to being transferred from the mounted unit, had you ever been transferred before?
 - A. Within patrol?
 - Q. Had you ever been transferred before?
- A. You're going to have to elaborate on transfer.
 - Q. What's your understanding of what a transfer
- 9 is?

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

18

19

20

- 10 A. When you're transferred from -- well, when 11 you're moved from place to place.
- 12 Q. So had you been moved from place to place,
 13 then, prior to being on mounted patrol?
- 14 A. Yes.
- Q. Are those the different areas that you just described earlier or others that you haven't mentioned to me yet?
 - A. I was transferred from different areas of patrol. I also did a temporary assignment in human resources after I injured my shoulder.
- Q. So approximately how many times would you say
 that you've been transferred prior to being
 transferred out of the mounted patrol unit?
 - A. Out of the mounted unit?

Q. Yes.

1

4

5

6

7

8

16

17

18

19

22

23

- 2 A. I got transferred out of the mounted unit to 3 patrol.
 - Q. Prior to that transfer, approximately how many times had you been transferred?
 - A. You asked me how many times have I been transferred since patrol a minute ago. I'm not sure if you're asking me now before or after.
 - Q. Let me just make sure that I'm clear.
- 10 A. Okay.
- 11 Q. The subject of your amended complaint is that

 12 you were transferred out of the mounted unit to

 13 patrol. Prior to the transfer that forms the basis of

 14 your lawsuit, prior to that transfer, how many times

 15 had you been transferred?
 - MR. MARTIN: For the record, you're talking about transfers within patrol because he was only in patrol from the academy up to the time of the mounted unit.
- 20 MS. SANFRANCESCO: Yes. I'm talking about 21 any transfers whatsoever.
 - A. For purposes of within the department, when you're moved from sector to sector, district to district, people's common knowledge is that's not a

transfer.

- 2 Q. What is that?
- 3 A. You're being moved.
- 4 Q. What is a transfer?
- 5 A. Transfer to a different unit is usually
- 6 something that the officer requests. Most cases to go
- 7 | to a specialized unit, from unit to unit.
- Q. Transfers aren't just made at an officer's
- 9 request, is that correct?
- 10 A. I would say yes.
- 11 Q. Are you familiar with New Castle County and New
- 12 | Castle County Police Department policy and procedure?
- 13 A. Some of it.
- 14 Q. Are you familiar with the procedures for
- 15 | transfer?
- 16 A. I'd have to read over that.
- 17 Q. At this time, what is your understanding as to
- 18 why someone can get transferred?
- 19 A. Any reason they choose.
- 20 Q. Who chooses?
- 21 A. The department.
- 22 Q. So you're saying that your understanding is the
- 23 department can choose to transfer someone at any time?
- 24 A. That's my understanding.

- Q. Can the department make transfers for any other reasons?
 - A. Backing up to my other answer, I believe they can transfer for any reason that they choose to.
- 5 Other than that, that pretty much says it all.
- Q. Where are you working right now, what's your assignment now?
- A. I am working on C Squad in the Southern Patrol
 District.
 - Q. And how long have you held that assignment?
- 11 A. Approximately since May of 2007. Yes. No.
- 12 May of 2006, I believe.

2

3

4

10

22

- Q. Were you transferred to C Squad SPU from the mounted unit or were you transferred to another place?
- 15 A. Another place.
- 16 | Q. Where was that?
- 17 A. I was transferred from mounted to C Squad,
 18 Central District.
- Q. So were you in Central District from the time
 of your transfer which would have been in March 2006
 and then you transferred to C Squad, SPU, in May 2006?
 - A. That's fairly accurate, yes.
- 23 | Q. How did you get from Central District to SPU?
 - A. I had told the lieutenant when I first came

- out. They asked me where I wanted to work.
- Q. Who asked you?
- A. Lieutenant Merrill.

4 MR. MARTIN: Can we go off the record for

5 a second?

1

2

6

7

8

9

10

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

MS. SANFRANCESCO: Sure.

(Pause.)

BY MS. SANFRANCESCO:

- Q. I think the question was, how did you get from Central District to SPU, and you said Lieutenant
- 11 | Merrill asked you where you wanted to work.
- A. When I first came out of the mounted unit to

 patrol, I was -- I recall speaking with Lieutenant

 Merrill, and I believe he asked if I had a preference

 in where I worked.
 - Q. How did you get to having this conversation with him?
 - A. I don't recall if it was in person or on the phone. I know I had a conversation with him. As I was -- after I was transferred, I had a conversation with him prior to me actually -- the date of actually starting on C Squad.
 - Q. Was he in your chain of command?
 - A. He was the lieutenant in charge of C Squad.

- Q. So he asked you where you wanted to work, and
- 2 | what did you tell him?
- 3 A. I believe he asked me if I had a preference,
- 4 and I explained, if I had a preference, I'd like to
- 5 | work in the Southern District.
- Q. And why did you have a preference to work in the Southern District?
- 8 A. I believe all the years I worked there the most 9 in patrol and I was familiar with the area.
- 10 Q. Do you also live in the Southern District?
- 11 | A. Yes.
- Q. Did he tell you, you know, you have to wait for
- 13 | a few months before you get down there? How did you
- 14 | eventually get, then, from Central District to SPU?
- 15 A. He had originally told me that it was -- there
 16 was no openings there. I said okay.
- 17 Q. And then --
- 18 A. I believe he said, "I need you to work in the
- 19 | Central District." That was the -- that was that.
- Q. At some point did an opening become available
- 21 | in SPU, Southern Patrol?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. And was that in May of 2006?
- 24 A. Yes.



- 17
- haven't -- our squad has not had a direct sergeant as 18
- 19 a supervisor.
- Who would you say is the next available, then, 20 0.
- 21 in your chain of command?
- In Southern Patrol Unit it would be Lieutenant 22
- Merrill. 23

What are your duties down at Southern Patrol?

- 1 A. Patrol the areas below the canal from the --
- 2 | basically from the canal, C&D Canal to Smyrna within
- 3 | our jurisdiction.
 - Q. What are your hours?
- 5 A. Well, they change. Shift work. Day work I
- 6 | work six in the morning till four in the afternoon.
- 7 | Evening shift I work 3:00 p.m. to 1:00 a.m., and the
- 8 | midnight shift, I'm currently working 9:00 p.m. to
- 9 5:00 a.m.

- 10 Q. Do you get shift differential?
- 11 | A. Yes.
- 12 Q. When you were transferred to Central District,
- 13 | generally were your duties to patrol the areas that
- 14 | make up the Central District?
- 15 | A. Yes.
- 16 | Q. And what were your hours at that time?
- 17 A. I believe they were the same as below the --
- 18 | where I'm working now, all three shifts.
- 19 Q. Shift differential again?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 | Q. When you worked at the mounted patrol unit,
- 22 | what were your hours?
- 23 A. Primarily the hours were 8:00 a.m. to 4:00 p.m.
- 24 Q. What days of the week?

- A. Primarily, but not always, Monday through Friday.
 - Q. Any shift differential there?
 - A. Yes. At times.
- Q. Can you explain?
- A. There were times when we worked evening shift, and there were times when we worked some very few weekends, some weekends.
- 9 Q. Would you say there's shift differential more
 10 so in your current assignment and your assignment at
 11 Central District than at mounted?
- 12 A. Yes.

2

3

4

- Q. Aside from your family, who would have knowledge of the matters contained in the complaint?

 I guess maybe before you answer that, a better way to ask this question is going to be taking a look at some of the people that are listed in your Rule 26 disclosures.
- MR. MARTIN: Off the record a moment.
- 20 (Recess taken.)
- 21 BY MS. SANFRANCESCO:
- Q. Corporal Hill, I placed in front of you your
- 23 Rule 26 disclosures, and what these are, under
- 24 number 1, we asked for the "name and, if known, the

address and telephone number of each individual likely to have discoverable information relevant to disputed

3 fact alleged with particularity in the pleadings."

So what I'm going to do is go through the
people that are listed in your initial disclosures and
in your amended disclosures and you can tell me who
they are and what they might know about the amended
complaint and the matters contained therein. Do you
have any questions about that before we start?

- A. Not at this time.
- 11 Q. So the second person listed on the list is
- 12 | Corporal Joseph Blythe?
- We are in the first one, that page.
- 14 A. Okay.

- 15 Q. Why is he listed there?
- 16 A. He was the union representative who was present
- 17 during my first step grievance process.
- 18 | Q. How about Phil Davis?
- 19 A. He is an officer that sometimes -- he used to
- 20 be a mounted officer. He sometimes -- he's an
- 21 | auxiliary rider who sometimes rides as well as
- 22 participates in different functions with the mounted
- 23 unit.
- Q. What can he tell us about the matters contained

in the complaint or amended complaint?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

15

16

- A. He was present at different times within the mounted unit as well as at the 2005 mounted competition.
- Q. When he was present, did he witness certain events or what relevance does he have to this litigation aside from what you've just said?
- A. It's my belief that he witnessed some of the events at the competition, yes.
 - O. What events were these?
- 11 A. He witnessed some of the comments made about me
 12 to Sergeant Hyden. He also witnessed some of the
 13 treatment I received after I completed the
 14 competition.
 - Q. When you say he witnessed some of the comments to Sergeant Hyden, who made the comments?
- A. Comments that I'm referring to were made by
 Corporal Hoff.
 - Q. Do you know what those comments were?
- A. The comment that I -- about we were just -
 there was a discussion about a portion of the horse

 that was dirty and Corporal Davis had relayed to me,

 that I took care of it. It was not a problem. But he

 wanted to let me know that Corporal Hoff was -- exact

- 1 | words I don't recall -- bad mouthing to me to Sergeant
- 2 | Hyden to try to get me in trouble.
- 3 Q. For what?
- A. For that portion of the horse that was -- that had been overlooked by myself.
- 6 | O. Is this the horse Chief?
- 7 A. Yes.

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

- 8 Q. You said he witnessed something else. I'm
- 9 sorry. I missed --
- A. He was at the competition. He participated in the competition. He was present after I received my awards and witnessed the reaction from the individuals within my department.
- Q. And what were those reactions and what individuals made those reactions?
 - A. Everybody in the mounted unit, including the individuals that travelled with us, were present when I left the competition ring after receiving my awards.
 - Q. When you said receive your awards, did you receive one award for each portion of the competition or was this a specific award for a certain portion of the competition?
 - A. Different awards for different portions of the competition.

- Q. So when you're talking about Phil Davis, was he present for each?
- 3 | A. Yes.

- 4 Q. And what happened?
- 5 A. Different reactions were from different people.
- 6 Most congratulated. Most were very excited about my 7 accomplishments. Some were not.
- 8 Q. What did he witness with respect to Sergeant 9 Hyden?
- 10 A. It is my belief that he witnessed that she was
 11 displeased by my performance and said nothing to me.
- 12 Q. Did you ever discuss this with him?
- 13 A. I don't recall if I did or not.
- Q. Did he witness any reaction, to your knowledge, by Corporal Hoff?
- 16 A. It's my belief that he witnessed her actions as well.
- 18 Q. Did you ever speak to him about that?
- A. I don't recall if I spoke with him about it after the fact.
- Q. And would Corporal Davis be able to tell us anything else regarding the matters contained in the complaint?
- 24 A. Possibly.



- Q. To your knowledge, at this time, anything other than that the -- what competition was this? What year?
 - A. I believe it was 2005. Yes.

knowledge, has he? I don't know.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

15

20

21

22

23

24

- Q. So aside from the events that you just discussed at the 2005 mounted competition?
- A. Corporal Davis has been in different functions within the mounted unit, not just that competition.

 So could he witness other things? Yes. To my
- 11 Q. Did you ever discuss anything else with him?
 12 I'm not saying that you discussed this with him, but
- have you ever discussed any of the events with him or any of the matters that are contained in the
- A. I do recall discussing some issues leading up
 to this. I believe it was a past -- I think it was
 this past mounted competition or -- I don't know if it
 was the one before that.
 - Q. When you say this past mounted, which year?
 - A. This would be '07.
 - Q. '07. Okay.

complaint.

What were those issues?

A. He was working as a detective down at Southern

Patrol, so there's been times when our shifts might cross. And I believe we were talking about the fact he still had my saddle rack that I purchased for the competition that was mine personally. And he had asked to borrow it the year before to help shine the saddle. And I could -- I just told him he could hold on to it as long as he needed it. I just started talking about the competition and just did -- he had told me that -- that he was -- something of the nature of Darla at the stables --

- Q. Corporal Hoff?
- 12 A. Corporal Hoff. I'm sorry. Yes.

Was irritating him at some level. He didn't go into explicit detail.

- Q. Irritating him at the stables at the 2007 competition?
- 17 | A. No. No. No.
- 18 | Q. Oh.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

13

14

15

16

- A. Prior to going to the competition. Exactly what his words were I don't remember. It wasn't a very long conversation.
- Q. Do you know why he would discuss Corporal Hoff with you?
 - A. He had said at times before that she was -- let

1 me back up. Phil -- I'm sorry -- Corporal Davis is 2 one that's always been very helpful when it comes to 3 preparing for the uniform mounted judging portion of 4 the national competition. He's helped a lot of 5 officers prepare because he's done it many years 6 before. He helped myself as well. And he was -- if I 7 recall correctly, he was just -- he would try to do something to assist the officers who were preparing, 8 9 and I believe he was saying that Darla kept interrupting him and trying to change things he was 10 11 doing to try to help, something of that nature. 12 When Corporal Davis participated or even helped 13 with the mounted unit at the national competition, was 14 he in the unit at the time? 15 Let me go back. Let's say for the 16 competition in 2005, was he in the mounted unit when 17 you attended that competition? 18 Α. No. 19 So he was just assisting the mounted unit in Q. 20 preparing for the competition? 21 Well, past members of the mounted unit are 22 considered auxiliary riders, I quess you could call 23 them. So he did participate in that competition as

24

well as assisted.

- Q. Was this something that Corporal Davis was really interested in? I mean, he wanted to stay involved with the mounted unit? Would you say that's fair to say?
 - A. Yes. That's fair.
 - Q. And was he very energetic about his participation?
- 8 A. Yes.

2

3

4

5

6

7

14

15

16

17

20

- 9 Q. What about Dominick Gregory, what can he tell us?
- A. He is a sergeant that works in the internal affairs division. And he investigated a portion of my complaint against Sergeant Hyden.
 - Q. And Colonel Rick Gregory?
 - A. He is the chief of police who runs the department, who I submitted my memorandum to regards -- regarding my complaint.
- Q. Did you ever have a conversation with Colonel Gregory about your complaint against Sergeant Hyden?
 - A. Yes, I did.
- 21 Q. When that was?
- A. After my submittal of the memorandum, and I believe it was -- I don't recall exactly when it was.
 - Q. But you believe it was after you submitted the

memorandum?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

11

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

- I don't recall exactly when the I believe. meeting was.
 - And memorandum that you are referring to, this Q. was from you to Colonel Gregory?
 - A. Yes.
 - Ο. And what was the nature of that memorandum?
- It was a memorandum, a complaint that I was Α. lodging against Sergeant Hyden in reference to -- I 9 believe the topics were truthfulness and conduct 10
- 12 Q. When you had your discussion with Colonel Gregory what did you discuss with him? 13
 - Α. He was not directly -- he did not have, in my opinion, knowledge of the whole complaint. And being that he was a new chief, I requested a meeting with him to explain myself and to let him know that I was dedicated to this police department and did not want him to get a misconception of what I was about.
 - Q. How long did that meeting last?
- 21. Α. Maybe a half hour.

towards a subordinate.

- 22 What about Major Hedrick? Q.
- 23 He was -- his name appeared on different Α. 24 documents in regards to evaluations, and at one time,

during the investigation by Captain Hitch, he had told me that he was going to be off. And if I had any complaints or anything to add to the case, to contact Major Hedrick, but -- I'm sorry. That's -- his name appeared on many documents. That's what I'm saying.

- Q. And you referenced evaluations?
- A. Right.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

13

14

15

16

17

18

- Q. Did he sign off as, you know, acting chief or was he a direct supervisor or -- in what capacity would he have signed off on the evaluation?
- 11 A. As being a staff member within the chain of command.
 - Q. And you said at one time during the investigation with Hitch, he told you to contact him for what reason?
 - A. I believe that Captain Hitch told me he was going to be off. For what reason I don't recall. If I had anything -- if I had any questions or anything about it to contact the major.
- Q. Oh, Captain Hitch told you to contact Major Hedrick?
- 22 A. Right.
- Q. Did you ever contact Major Hedrick about anything with reference regarding Sergeant Hyden or

- your complaints?
- 2 A. No.

- 3 Q. Major Hedrick still work for the county?
- 4 A. No. Well, not as a police officer. I don't
- 5 know if he does other than that or not.
- 6 Q. Captain Mark Hitch is listed next, and I
- 7 understand from the documents and from the allegations
- 8 | in the complaint that he was responsible for
- 9 investigating the complaint that you had made against
- 10 | Sergeant Hyden, is that correct?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. Aside from that investigation, is there any
- 13 other reason that he would be listed here?
- 14 A. Possibly. Not off the top of my head -- I
- 15 can't think of anything.
- 16 Q. Number 9, Robert Larrimore, internal affairs,
- 17 | why is he listed.
- 18 A. He was in the Internal Affairs Division. At
- 19 one point in time there was some -- at one point in
- 20 time during this investigation.
- 21 Q. Did he, to your knowledge, investigate any
- 22 | portion of your complaint against Sergeant Hyden?
- 23 A. Not to my knowledge.
- Q. Is he simply listed because he was in the unit